**RENE**

INTERVIEWER: Well, let me ask you about this experiment and his argument. So, does it look like the evidence that he has in this experiment supports this argument that he makes that plants gain weight from nutrients in the soil?

RENE: Yeah. Yeah. You could easily say that his experiment… I mean, here you had the MiracleGro and it grows 15 more grams than the one without it. So right there it shows you, "Oh yeah. I guess they do." So I think his experiment fit that answer.

INTERVIEWER: So where did that extra 15 grams come from? [0:18:01.7]

RENE: The root structure is probably a bit bigger and you can even see that the plant grew bigger so that's going to add more weight.

**ROBIN**

INTERVIEWER: Okay. Are there any weaknesses in Mike's argument?

ROBIN: Yeah, because there could be other factors affecting that and they don't really talk about that, like maybe this plant could have been put more in the sunlight or I don't even know if something else. You don't know if the conditions were the same between the two plants.

**SARAH**

INTERVIEWER:…..So what do you think about his argument?

SARAH: I think he proved a point on that one but one with same growing conditions? I’m going to say yes. I’m going to assume that it is. And he gave one a little bit of MiracleGro, the other one just the sun, the soil that was in there. And the results are here. The plant with fertilizer is bigger, weighs more.

INTERVIEWER: So in his evidence here, which pieces of evidence tell you that the plant gained mass from the soil?

SARAH: The weight of the plant.

INTERVIEWER: Which plant?

SARAH: The one with fertilizer, 65g. While the one without fertilizer is 50. But the MiracleGro had 3g in it, so technically it didn’t gain the 15, let’s just say it gained 12. But still, it’s still a growth from going without fertilizer. [0:14:03.4]

INTERVIEWER: Do you have any idea where that 12g may have come from? That other 12g?

SARAH: No idea.

**LUCY**

INTERVIEWER: Do you see any weaknesses in Mike’s argument?

LUCY: Well, the only weakness is; Where was it grown at? Where were the plants? Were they indoors? Were they outdoors? Were they controlled environment? Was one inside one room, one in the other? Were they next to each other? It’s not only weaknesses, it’s not enough evidence out here to prove that he’s right. The only evidence that helps his case is he used the plant with fertilizer and it grew more. So nutrients from the soil, sure. But we don’t know anything else about it.

**JANE**INTERVIEWER: Can you explain Karen’s argument?

JANE: It shows that she didn't put that much soil in her little flowerpot. Then she got the seeds in there and then she watered it. And then the air helps the plant grow and get stronger and now the plant weighs 50 grams and then the soil weighs less, so I just …

INTERVIEWER: So, where do you think that 50 grams came from? Do you think it came from the soil?

JANE: The soil and …

INTERVIEWER: It was 80 and 78, right?

JANE: Yeah. I think it came from the soil because the plant has to like eat from the soil and all the nutrients. So, it weighs less because the plant ate it all up and now it's like 50 grams now because it needed that food and the air.

INTERVIEWER: Well how much did the soil lose? Eighty and 78, right? So, how many grams did the soil lose?

JANE: Like 2.

INTERVIEWER: Two grams, right?

JANE: Yeah.

INTERVIEWER: And how many grams did the plant gain?

JANE: Like a lot.

INTERVIEWER: So, you think … what do you think? Do you think it came from the dirt?

JANE: Yes, I do. I do because … I mean if the soil weighs like less now then I think the plant ate it all.

**TIM**

TEACHER: Can you explain what Karen did?

TIM: I think she added a lot of water than she needed. And like the water kept dissolving the soil which made it lighter.

INTERVIEWER: Ok but that's her claim. So she said plants gain most of their weight from the air. So how did this experiment support her idea?

TIM: I think it supports her because she left the plant I think outside and let it get some air and which made it grow. Which she added a little bit of water which then dissolved the soil and then that's it. I think that's it.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. So are there some weaknesses in her argument?

TIM: Yes.

INTERVIEWER: Ok, like what?

TIM: Like she said it needed air just when the, it needed a little bit of water but not, doesn't like soil on it in the pot.

INTERVIEWER: Ok. What would make Karen's evidence stronger? What would make her claim stronger?

TIM: That plants and trees need water too instead of just air.